



STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA  
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL  
BOARD OF REVIEW

Sherri A. Young, DO, MBA, FAAFP  
Cabinet Secretary

Christopher G. Nelson  
Interim Inspector General

January 30, 2024



RE: [REDACTED] v. WV DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES BUREAU  
FOR FAMILY ASSISTANCE  
ACTION NO.: 24-BOR-1087

Dear [REDACTED]:

Enclosed is a copy of the decision resulting from the hearing held in the above-referenced matter.

In arriving at a decision, the State Hearing Officer is governed by the Public Welfare Laws of West Virginia and the rules and regulations established by the Department of Human Services. These same laws and regulations are used in all cases to ensure that all persons are treated alike.

You will find attached an explanation of possible actions you may take if you disagree with the decision reached in this matter.

Sincerely,

Kristi Logan  
Certified State Hearing Officer  
Member, State Board of Review

Encl: Recourse to Hearing Decision  
Form IG-BR-29

cc: Crystal Bailes, [REDACTED] DoHS

**WEST VIRGINIA OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL  
BOARD OF REVIEW**

██████████,

**Appellant,**

**v.**

**Action Number: 24-BOR-1087**

**WEST VIRGINIA DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES  
BUREAU FOR FAMILY ASSISTANCE,**

**Respondent.**

**DECISION OF STATE HEARING OFFICER**

**INTRODUCTION**

This is the decision of the State Hearing Officer resulting from a fair hearing for ██████████. This hearing was held in accordance with the provisions found in Chapter 700 of the Office of Inspector General Common Chapters Manual. This fair hearing was convened on January 24, 2024, on an appeal filed on December 29, 2023.

The matter before the Hearing Officer arises from the November 2, 2023, decision by the Respondent to reduce the Appellant's Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP) benefits.

At the hearing, the Respondent appeared by Crystal Bailes, Economic Service Worker. The Appellant represented herself. The witnesses were placed under oath and the following documents were admitted into evidence.

**Department's Exhibits:**

- D-1 Board of Review Scheduling Order dated January 10, 2024
- D-2 Hearing Request Notification Form
- D-3 Hearing Request received December 29, 2023
- D-4 Notice of Decision dated November 2, 2023
- D-5 Case Comments from October 2023 through January 2024
- D-6 Social Security Administration Award Letter dated August 3, 2023
- D-7 West Virginia Income Maintenance Manual §4.4.3 and Chapter 4 Appendix A

### **Appellant's Exhibits:**

None

After a review of the record, including testimony, exhibits, and stipulations admitted into evidence at the hearing, and after assessing the credibility of all witnesses and weighing the evidence in consideration of the same, the Hearing Officer sets forth the following Findings of Fact.

### **FINDINGS OF FACT**

- 1) The Appellant was a recipient of SNAP benefits for a three-person assistance group.
- 2) On August 31, 2023, the Respondent mailed the Consolidated Work Notice to the Appellant advising that [REDACTED] was required to register with WorkForce WV to continue receiving SNAP benefits.
- 3) On October 2, 2023, the Respondent imposed a work registration penalty against [REDACTED] when it was determined that he had not registered with WorkForce WV.
- 4) On October 12, 2023, [REDACTED] contacted the Respondent regarding the work registration penalty and was advised that he must register with WorkForce WV or meet an exemption to continue receiving SNAP benefits (Exhibit D-5).
- 5) The Appellant's SNAP benefits were decreased from \$630 to \$399, effective November 1, 2023, due to the removal of [REDACTED] from the SNAP assistance group.
- 6) The Appellant submitted an interim contact form (PRC-2) to the Respondent on October 27, 2023.
- 7) The Appellant reported the onset of Supplemental Security Income (SSI) for her daughter of \$457 a month (Exhibit D-6).
- 8) The Appellant's SNAP benefits decreased from \$399 to \$46 a month, effective December 1, 2023, due to the increase in income (Exhibit D-4).

### **APPLICABLE POLICY**

**Code of Federal Regulations 7 CFR §273.7** describes work requirements and SNAP:

#### **(a) Work requirements**

**(1)** As a condition of eligibility for SNAP benefits, each household member who is not exempt under paragraph (b)(1) of this section must comply with the following SNAP work requirements:

- (i) Register for work or be registered by the State agency at the time of application and every 12 months after initial registration. The member required to register need not complete the registration form.
- (ii) Participate in a Food Stamp Employment and Training (E&T) program if assigned by the State agency, to the extent required by the State agency;
- (iii) Participate in a workfare program if assigned by the State agency;
- (iv) Provide the State agency or its designee with sufficient information regarding employment status or availability for work;
- (v) Report to an employer to whom referred by the State agency or its designee if the potential employment meets the suitability requirements described in paragraph (h) of this section;
- (vi) Accept a bona fide offer of suitable employment, as defined in paragraph (h) of this section, at a site or plant not subject to a strike or lockout, at a wage equal to the higher of the Federal or State minimum wage or 80 percent of the wage that would have governed had the minimum hourly rate under section 6(a)(1) of the Fair Labor Standards Act been applicable to the offer of employment.
- (vii) Do not voluntarily and without good cause quit a job of 30 or more hours a week or reduce work effort to less than 30 hours a week, in accordance with paragraph (j) of this section...

(3) Each State agency will determine the meaning of any other terms used in paragraph (a)(1) of this section; the procedures for establishing compliance with SNAP work requirements; and whether an individual is complying with SNAP work requirements. A State agency must not use a meaning, procedure, or determination that is less restrictive on SNAP recipients than is a comparable meaning, procedure, or determination under the State agency's program funded under title IV-A of the Social Security Act.

### **(c)State Agency Responsibilities**

- (1)(i) The State agency must register for work each household member not exempted by the provisions of paragraph (b)(1) of this section. The State agency must permit the applicant to complete a record or form for each household member required to register for employment in accordance with paragraph (a)(1)(i) of this section. Household members are considered to have registered when an identifiable work registration form is submitted to the State agency or when the registration is otherwise annotated or recorded by the State agency.
- (ii) During the certification process, the State agency must provide a written notice and oral explanation to the household of all applicable work requirements for all members of the household and identify which household member is subject to which work requirement. These work requirements include the general work requirement in paragraph (a) of this section, mandatory E&T in paragraph (a)(1)(ii) of this section, and the ABAWD work requirement at §273.24. The written notice and oral explanation must be provided in accordance with (c)(1)(iii) of this section. This written notice and oral explanation must also be provided to the household when a previously exempt household member or a new household member becomes subject to these work requirements, and at recertification.
- (iii) The consolidated written notice must include all pertinent information related to each of the applicable work requirements, including: An explanation of each applicable work requirement; which individuals are subject to which work requirement; exemptions from each applicable work requirement; an explanation of the process to request an exemption (including

contact information to request an exemption); the rights and responsibilities of each applicable work requirement; what is required to maintain eligibility under each applicable work requirement; pertinent dates by which an individual must take any actions to remain in compliance with each applicable work requirement; the consequences for failure to comply with each applicable work requirement; an explanation of the process for requesting good cause (including examples of good cause circumstances and contact information to initiate a good cause request); and any other information the State agency believes would assist the household members with compliance.

**(f)(2) Disqualification periods.** The following disqualification periods will be imposed:

**(i)** For the first occurrence of noncompliance, the individual will be disqualified until the later of:

(A) The date the individual complies, as determined by the State agency; (B) One month; or (C) Up to three months, at State agency option.

**(ii)** For the second occurrence, until the later of: (A) The date the individual complies, as determined by the State agency; (B) Three months; or (C) Up to six months, at State agency option. **(iii)** For the third or subsequent occurrence, until the later of: (A) The date the individual complies, as determined by the State agency; (B) Six months; (C) A date determined by the State agency; or (D) At the option of the State agency, permanently.

**Code of Federal Regulations – 7 CFR §273.9** provides information regarding SNAP income and deductions:

**(a) Income eligibility standards.** Participation in SNAP shall be limited to those households whose incomes are determined to be a substantial limiting factor in permitting them to obtain a more nutritious diet. Households which contain an elderly or disabled member shall meet the net income eligibility standards for SNAP. Households which do not contain an elderly or disabled member shall meet both the net income eligibility standards and the gross income eligibility standards for SNAP. Households which are categorically eligible do not have to meet either the gross or net income eligibility standards.

**(1)** The gross income eligibility standards for SNAP shall be as follows:

**(i)** The income eligibility standards for the 48 contiguous States and the District of Columbia, Guam and the Virgin Islands shall be 130 percent of the Federal income poverty levels for the 48 contiguous States and the District of Columbia.

**(2)** The net income eligibility standards for SNAP shall be as follows:

**(i)** The income eligibility standards for the 48 contiguous States and the District of Columbia, Guam and the Virgin Islands shall be the Federal income poverty levels for the 48 contiguous States and the District of Columbia.

**(3)** The income eligibility limits, as described in this paragraph, are revised each October 1 to reflect the annual adjustment to the Federal income poverty guidelines for the 48 States and the District of Columbia, for Alaska, and for Hawaii.

(i) 130 percent of the annual income poverty guidelines shall be divided by 12 to determine the monthly gross income standards, rounding the results upwards as necessary. For households greater than eight persons, the increment in the Federal income poverty guidelines is multiplied by 130 percent, divided by 12, and the results rounded upward if necessary.

(ii) The annual income poverty guidelines shall be divided by 12 to determine the monthly net income eligibility standards, rounding the results upward as necessary. For households greater than eight persons, the increment in the Federal income poverty guidelines is divided by 12, and the results rounded upward if necessary.

**(b) Definition of income.** Household income shall mean all income from whatever source excluding only items specified in [paragraph \(c\)](#) of this section.

**(1)** Earned income shall include:

(i) All wages and salaries of an employee

**(2)** Unearned income shall include, but not be limited to:

(i) Assistance payments from Federal or federally aided public assistance programs, such as supplemental security income (SSI) or Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF); general assistance (GA) programs (as defined in [§271.2](#)); or other assistance programs based on need.

**(d) Income deductions.** Deductions shall be allowed only for the following household expenses:

**(1) Standard deduction —**

(i) Effective October 1, 2002, in the 48 States and the District of Columbia, Alaska, Hawaii, and the Virgin Islands, the standard deduction for household sizes one through six shall be equal to 8.31 percent of the monthly net income eligibility standard for each household size established under [paragraph \(a\)\(2\)](#) of this section rounded up to the nearest whole dollar. For household sizes greater than six, the standard deduction shall be equal to the standard deduction for a six-person household.

**(2) Earned income deduction.** Twenty percent of gross earned income as defined in [paragraph \(b\)\(1\)](#) of this section. Earnings excluded in [paragraph \(c\)](#) of this section shall not be included in gross earned income for purposes of computing the earned income deduction, except that the State agency must count any earnings used to pay child support that were excluded from the household's income in accordance with the child support exclusion in [paragraph \(c\)\(17\)](#) of this section.

**(3) Excess medical deduction.** That portion of medical expenses in excess of \$35 per month, excluding special diets, incurred by any household member who is elderly or disabled as defined in [§271.2](#). Spouses or other persons receiving benefits as a dependent of the SSI or

disability and blindness recipient are not eligible to receive this deduction but persons receiving emergency SSI benefits based on presumptive eligibility are eligible for this deduction.

**(4) Dependent care.** Payments for dependent care when necessary for a household member to search for, accept or continue employment, comply with the employment and training requirements as specified under [§273.7\(e\)](#), or attend training or pursue education that is preparatory to employment, except as provided in [§273.10\(d\)\(1\)\(i\)](#). Costs that may be deducted are limited to the care of an individual for whom the household provides dependent care, including care of a child under the age of 18 or an incapacitated person of any age in need of care. The costs of care provided by a relative may be deducted so long as the relative providing care is not part of the same SNAP household as the child or dependent adult receiving care. Dependent care expenses must be separately identified, necessary to participate in the care arrangement, and not already paid by another source on behalf of the household.

**(5) Optional child support deduction.** At its option, the State agency may provide a deduction, rather than the income exclusion provided under [paragraph \(c\)\(17\)](#) of this section, for legally obligated child support payments paid by a household member to or for a non-household member, including payments made to a third party on behalf of the non-household member (vendor payments) and amounts paid toward child support arrearages. Alimony payments made to or for a non-household member shall not be included in the child support deduction.

**(6) Shelter costs —**

**(i) Homeless shelter deduction.** A State agency may provide a standard homeless shelter deduction of \$143 a month to households in which all members are homeless individuals but are not receiving free shelter throughout the month. The deduction must be subtracted from net income in determining eligibility and allotments for the households.

**(ii) Excess shelter deduction.** Monthly shelter expenses in excess of 50 percent of the household's income after all other deductions in [paragraphs \(d\)\(1\)](#) through [\(d\)\(5\)](#) of this section have been allowed. If the household does not contain an elderly or disabled member, as defined in [§271.2 of this chapter](#), the shelter deduction cannot exceed the maximum shelter deduction limit established for the area. For fiscal year 2001, effective March 1, 2001, the maximum monthly excess shelter expense deduction limits are \$340 for the 48 contiguous States and the District of Columbia, \$543 for Alaska, \$458 for Hawaii, \$399 for Guam, and \$268 for the Virgin Islands. FNS will set the maximum monthly excess shelter expense deduction limits for fiscal year 2002 and future years by adjusting the previous year's limits to reflect changes in the shelter component and the fuels and utilities component of the Consumer Price Index for All Urban Consumers for the 12 month period ending the previous November 30. FNS will notify State agencies of the amount of the limit. Only the following expenses are allowable shelter expenses:

**(iii) Standard utility allowances.**

(A) With FNS approval, a State agency may develop the following standard utility allowances (standards) to be used in place of actual costs in determining a household's excess shelter deduction: an individual standard for each type of utility expense; a standard utility allowance for all utilities that includes heating or cooling costs (HCSUA); and, a limited utility allowance (LUA) that includes electricity and fuel for purposes other than heating or cooling, water, sewerage, well and septic tank installation and maintenance, telephone, and garbage or trash collection. The LUA must include expenses for at least two utilities.

**Code of Federal Regulations Title 7 §273.10 Determining household eligibility and benefit levels.**

**(e) Calculating net income and benefit levels —**

**(1) Net monthly income.**

(i) To determine a household's net monthly income, the State agency shall:

(A) Add the gross monthly income earned by all household members and the total monthly unearned income of all household members, minus income exclusions, to determine the household's total gross income.

(B) Multiply the total gross monthly earned income by 20 percent and subtract that amount from the total gross income; or multiply the total gross monthly earned income by 80 percent and add that to the total monthly unearned income, minus income exclusions.

(C) Subtract the standard deduction.

(D) If the household is entitled to an excess medical deduction as provided in [§273.9\(d\)\(3\)](#), determine if total medical expenses exceed \$35. If so, subtract that portion which exceeds \$35.

(E) Subtract allowable monthly dependent care expenses, if any, as specified under [§273.9\(d\)\(4\)](#) for each dependent.

(F) If the State agency has chosen to treat legally obligated child support payments as a deduction rather than an exclusion in accordance with [§273.9\(d\)\(5\)](#), subtract allowable monthly child support payments in accordance with [§273.9\(d\)\(5\)](#).

(G) Subtract the homeless shelter deduction, if any, up to the maximum of \$143.

(H) Total the allowable shelter expenses to determine shelter costs. Subtract from total shelter costs 50 percent of the household's monthly income after all the above deductions have been subtracted. The remaining amount, if any, is the excess shelter cost. If there is no excess shelter cost, the net monthly income has been determined. If there is excess shelter cost, compute the shelter deduction according to [paragraph \(e\)\(1\)\(i\)\(I\)](#) of this section.



(I) Subtract the excess shelter cost up to the maximum amount allowed for the area (unless the household is entitled to the full amount of its excess shelter expenses) from the household's monthly income after all other applicable deductions. Households not subject to a capped shelter expense shall have the full amount exceeding 50 percent of their net income subtracted. The household's net monthly income has been determined.

(ii) In calculating net monthly income, the State agency shall use one of the following two procedures:

(A) Round down each income and allotment calculation that ends in 1 through 49 cents and round up each calculation that ends in 50 through 99 cents; or

(B) Apply the rounding procedure that is currently in effect for the State's Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF) program. If the State TANF program includes the cents in income calculations, the State agency may use the same procedures for SNAP income calculations. Whichever procedure is used, the State agency may elect to include the cents associated with each individual shelter cost in the computation of the shelter deduction and round the final shelter deduction amount. Likewise, the State agency may elect to include the cents associated with each individual medical cost in the computation of the medical deduction and round the final medical deduction amount.

## **(2) Eligibility and benefits.**

(i) (A) Households which contain an elderly or disabled member as defined in [§271.2](#), shall have their net income, as calculated in [paragraph \(e\)\(1\)](#) of this section (except for households considered destitute in accordance with [paragraph \(e\)\(3\)](#) of this section), compared to the monthly income eligibility standards defined in [§273.9\(a\)\(2\)](#) for the appropriate household size to determine eligibility for the month.

(B) In addition to meeting the net income eligibility standards, households which do not contain an elderly or disabled member shall have their gross income, as calculated in accordance with [paragraph \(e\)\(1\)\(i\)\(A\)](#) of this section, compared to the gross monthly income standards defined in [§ 273.9\(a\)\(1\)](#) for the appropriate household size to determine eligibility for the month.

(ii)(A) Except as provided in [paragraphs \(a\)\(1\)](#), [\(e\)\(2\)\(iii\)](#) and [\(e\)\(2\)\(vi\)](#) of this section, the household's monthly allotment shall be equal to the maximum SNAP allotment for the household's size reduced by 30 percent of the household's net monthly income as calculated in [paragraph \(e\)\(1\)](#) of this section. If 30 percent of the household's net income ends in cents, the State agency shall round in one of the following ways:

(I) The State agency shall round the 30 percent of net income up to the nearest higher dollar; or

(2) The State agency shall not round the 30 percent of net income at all. Instead, after subtracting the 30 percent of net income from the appropriate Thrifty Food Plan, the State agency shall round the allotment down to the nearest lower dollar.

(B) If the calculation of benefits in accordance with [paragraph \(e\)\(2\)\(ii\)\(A\)](#) of this section for an initial month would yield an allotment of less than \$10 for the household, no benefits shall be issued to the household for the initial month.

**West Virginia Income Maintenance Manual §14.3.1.A** states all individuals must register for employment with WorkForce West Virginia, within 30 days of the date of the original approval, unless exempt. Clients must register every 12 months thereafter, regardless of the length of time that WorkForce West Virginia considers the registration valid.

The Consolidated Work Notice (CWN) is sent to the SNAP AG when an individual(s) is required to register with job service through Workforce WV. The CWN details who must register and the due date of registration. The CWN also explains why the individual(s) is required to register and how to register. Actions which constitute a registration are defined by WorkForce West Virginia and the eligibility system must:

- Match with WorkForce West Virginia. Registration date updated.
- Match the date returned from WorkForce West Virginia is more than 12 months old. The client must register again.
- Match with WorkForce West Virginia with inactive job status and no job preference. The client must choose a job preference and become active to be considered registered.
- Match with WorkForce West Virginia with inactive job status and with job preference. The client must become active to be considered registered.
- Match with WorkForce West Virginia with active job status and no job preference. The client must choose a job preference to be considered registered.

Once the client registers with WorkForce West Virginia for Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP) purposes, he cannot be required to register more often than every 12 months, even when the benefit is opened and closed within the 12-month period. This is tracked through the eligibility system.

**West Virginia Income Maintenance Manual §14.5.1.B** states a client who refuses or fails to register with Workforce West Virginia, refuses employment, or refuses to provide information about employment status and job availability is subject to the following penalties for the full penalty period or until he reports a change which makes him exempt from the work requirements.

- First violation: The client is removed from the assistance group (AG) for at least three months or until he/she meets an exemption. If after three months, the client has not complied or met an exemption, the penalty continues until he/she does comply or meets an exemption for some reason other than Unemployment Compensation Insurance (UCI)-related activities.
- Second violation: The client is removed from the AG for six months or until he/she meets an exemption. If after six months, the client has not complied or met an exemption, the

penalty continues until he/she does comply or meets an exemption for some reason other than UCI-related activities.

- Third and subsequent violations: The client is removed from the AG for twelve months or until he/she meets an exemption. If after 12 months, the client has not complied or met an exemption, the penalty continues until he/she does comply or meets an exemption for some reason other than UCI-related activities.

## **DISCUSSION**

Pursuant to federal regulations, an individual must register with Workforce WV within 30 days of the date of initial SNAP approval and every 12 months thereafter as a condition of eligibility to receive SNAP benefits, unless exempt. An individual who fails to comply by the due date established on the notice to register is subject to a SNAP penalty.

The Respondent notified the Appellant on August 31, 2023, that [REDACTED] was required to register with WorkForce WV within 30 days to continue receiving SNAP benefits. A penalty was imposed against [REDACTED], with an effective date of November 1, 2023, when the registration had not been completed. The Appellant's SNAP benefits were reduced due to the removal of [REDACTED] from the SNAP assistance group. The Appellant's SNAP benefits were further reduced, effective December 1, 2023, due to the onset of SSI income for her daughter.

The Appellant testified that she was confused about the work registration requirement for [REDACTED], thinking that he did not need to comply. The Appellant did not dispute the amount of income the Respondent used in determining the monthly SNAP allotment or provide testimony regarding additional income deductions.

Policy and federal regulations stipulate that monthly SNAP allotments are determined by an assistance group's countable income after all allowable deductions have been applied. With the removal of [REDACTED] from the SNAP assistance group, the Appellant's SNAP benefits were calculated for a two-person assistance group. The addition of the Appellant's daughter's SSI income further reduced her monthly SNAP allotment.

Whereas [REDACTED] failed to register with WorkForce WV, the Respondent's action to remove him from the SNAP assistance group is affirmed. The Respondent correctly included the Appellant's daughter's SSI income in determining SNAP eligibility, based on a two-person assistance group.

## **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- 1) Monthly SNAP allotments are determined by the size of an assistance group and its countable income after all allowable deductions have been applied.
- 2) SNAP recipients are required to register every 12 months, or meet an exemption, to receive SNAP benefits.

- 3) The Respondent notified the Appellant of [REDACTED] requirement to register with WorkForce WV, or meet an exemption, to continue receiving SNAP benefits.
- 4) A work registration penalty was imposed against [REDACTED], removing him from the SNAP assistance group, when he failed to register or meet an exemption.
- 5) The Respondent correctly calculated the Appellant's SNAP benefits based upon the countable income for a two-person assistance group.

### **DECISION**

It is the decision of the State Hearing Office to **uphold** the decision of the Respondent to reduce the Appellant's monthly Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program benefits.

**ENTERED this 30<sup>th</sup> day of January 2024.**

---

**Kristi Logan**  
**Certified State Hearing Officer**