

# Duration of Untreated Chlamydial Genital Infection and Factors Associated with Clearance: Review of Animal Studies

Isao Miyairi,<sup>1</sup> Kyle H. Ramsey,<sup>2</sup> and Dorothy L. Patton<sup>3</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Molecular Sciences and Pediatrics, University of Tennessee Health Science Center, Memphis; <sup>2</sup>Department of Microbiology and Immunology, Chicago College of Osteopathic Medicine, Midwestern University, Downers Grove, Illinois; <sup>3</sup>Department of Obstetrics and Gynecology, University of Washington, Seattle

*Chlamydia trachomatis* is an important cause of sexually transmitted infection that can manifest as acute cervicitis, pelvic inflammatory disease, and most commonly, chronic asymptomatic infection. The basis of this wide spectrum of manifestations and the factors that lead to clearance or chronic infection are poorly understood. We reviewed specific literature pertaining to clearance of primary genital tract infections in animal models, including mice, guinea pigs, pigs, sheep, and nonhuman primates. T helper 1 cell responses involved in cell-mediated immunity are key immune parameters that define efficient clearance in the murine and guinea pig models of chlamydial infection, which are useful for studying *C. trachomatis* clearance. However, there may be some differences between humans and other animals in innate and adaptive immune responses to chlamydial infection. Studies have suggested that differences in the induced T cell subsets and the species-specific differences in interferon  $\gamma$ -mediated effector mechanisms may play a significant role in these discrepancies. To close these gaps in knowledge, translational research in humans is a critical next step. However, for questions about specific mechanisms of host-pathogen interaction that cannot be answered feasibly or ethically in humans, animal models will continue to be important. Future research should include use of humanized and nonmurine models that establish prolonged infection to improve understanding of chronic human infections.

*Chlamydia trachomatis* continues to be the most common bacterial cause of sexually transmitted infections in the United States; >1 million cases of *C. trachomatis* infection were reported to the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention in 2007 [1]. Reported case rates of chlamydial infection among women have more than tripled in the past 2 decades, in the era of increasing

implementation of screening and early intervention strategies. The World Health Organization estimates that >90 million persons are infected worldwide [2]. Infection occurs in all socioeconomic groups and geographic areas. *C. trachomatis* genital tract infection is associated with many syndromes, including cervicitis, urethritis, endometritis, and salpingitis, and long-term sequelae include tubal infertility and ectopic pregnancy in women and urethritis, proctitis, and epididymitis in men. The infection is commonly asymptomatic and indolent and may not be cleared for several months to years [3].

A number of studies have characterized immunological responses in humans that implicate the importance of cell-mediated immunity in clearance of infection [4]. Because of the observational nature of human studies, the precise mechanism of how *C. trachomatis* establishes chronic infection and is ultimately cleared remains obscure. There are major ethical and technical

Potential conflicts of interest: None reported.

Financial support: Children's Infection Defense Center/St Jude Children's Research Hospital (to I.M.), National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health (AI081050), American Heart Association (09GBIA2050135).

Supplement sponsorship: This article is part of a supplement entitled "Chlamydia trachomatis Genital Infection: Natural History, Immunobiology, and Implications for Control Programs," which was sponsored by the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention.

Reprints or correspondence: Dr Miyairi, Dept of Molecular Sciences and Pediatrics, University of Tennessee Health Science Center, 858 Madison Ave, Memphis, TN 38163 (imiyairi@uthsc.edu).

The Journal of Infectious Diseases 2010;201(S2):S96–S103

© 2010 by the Infectious Diseases Society of America. All rights reserved.

0022-1899/2010/20112S2-0004\$15.00

DOI: 10.1086/652393

limitations in studying both the natural course of infection and factors that may influence the outcome of these infections in humans. Thus, investigators have developed various complementary animal models in attempts to elucidate *C. trachomatis* pathogenesis [5–9].

This review summarizes the evidence from animal models pertaining to clearance of primary chlamydial infection from the genital tract. The natural course and duration of chlamydial infection in each model is discussed, followed by specific factors that have been found to contribute to its clearance. Factors associated with duration of clearance in repeat infections are related to protective immunity and will be discussed elsewhere in this supplement [10]. We also define limitations in extrapolating information obtained from animal models to humans and provide insights into how animal models may better approximate and help characterize the response to *C. trachomatis* infection in humans.

## METHODS

We performed a comprehensive review of the literature based on 2 methods. A PubMed literature search using the terms “*Chlamydia trachomatis* + genital tract infection,” “*Chlamydia trachomatis* + animal model,” and “*Chlamydia trachomatis* + mouse model,” limited to the English language, yielded >1000 articles. Relevant articles were manually selected. Articles related to pulmonary and ocular infection as well as vaccine studies were excluded, with a few exceptions. An initial list of ~200 references was compiled and then further refined. Included on the list are several excellent reviews related to this topic [9, 11–15]. References from these articles were also reviewed. Each article was carefully reviewed to gather evidence pertaining to clearance of primary infection from the genital tract. Because immunity that provides protection from future infection is reviewed separately in this supplement [10], we excluded models and findings pertaining to repeat infections.

## ANIMAL MODELS OF CHLAMYDIAL INFECTION

Humans are the exclusive natural host for *C. trachomatis*, although many animals are naturally infected with other species of *Chlamydia*. Humans have been used as an “animal model” for infectious diseases caused by a number of pathogens, including sexually transmitted infections caused by *Haemophilus ducreyi* (human chancroid challenge model) [16] and *Neisseria gonorrhoeae* (urethral challenge model) [17]. However, a human chlamydial genital challenge model has been considered to be impractical and, perhaps, unsafe because of concerns about long duration of infection, risk of secondary transmission, and relative ineffectiveness of treatment.

Although other sexually transmitted infections, such as gonorrhea, syphilis, and human papillomavirus, are strongly adapted to humans and generally lack useful animal models,

animal models for chlamydial genital tract infection reflect many aspects of human disease and have been extremely useful in defining factors that correlate not only with clearance but also with pathogenesis and the development of protective immunity. Animal models have been established in mice [7, 8], guinea pigs [5, 6], pigs [18], sheep [19], and nonhuman primates [20, 21]. These models often use natural pathogen-host combinations, although the route of infection may be unnatural. Thus, models differ substantially in the chlamydial species used for infection, the degree and type of pathology induced, the immune responses provoked, and the duration of infection. Obviously, no single animal species can duplicate exactly what occurs in humans, and it is important to tease out evidence from animal models that can be generalized to humans. Here, we summarize the evidence pertaining to the most commonly used mouse, guinea pig, and nonhuman primate models pertaining to duration and clearance of infection. We also highlight the discrepancies and similarities among models to address future avenues in animal and translational research.

**Mouse models using *Chlamydia muridarum*.** Mouse models of chlamydial genital tract infection use common inbred mice strains and *C. muridarum* (previously known as *C. trachomatis* mouse pneumonitis strain, or MoPn). It is the most commonly used model because of the reproducible disease course, cost, and ability to manipulate immune parameters. Although earlier studies lacked uniformity of design, the model as currently used involves pretreatment with progesterone and a relatively low inoculum (median infective dose, 10–100 inclusion-forming units) delivered intravaginally. Progesterone treatment of mice increases the rate of infection and the number of chlamydiae isolated from the vaginal vault but does not affect the duration of infection [8, 22]. Studies from different laboratories have found similar kinetics of chlamydial infection and disease. Infection is monitored by swabbing the cervix via the vagina and measuring the quantity of chlamydiae (as inclusion-forming units) in cell cultures.

*C. muridarum* establishes infections in mice [7] with median infective doses as low as 100 inclusion-forming units. The quantity of *C. muridarum* rapidly increases during the first 7–10 days, plateaus, and rapidly decreases 3–4 weeks after infection. This relatively robust infection readily ascends to the upper genital tract and causes oviduct pathology after 5–6 weeks, making this a potentially useful model for studying the kinetics of acute lower urogenital tract infection and acute and chronic upper genital tract pathology. A single episode of infection can result in tubal infertility and fibrosis [23, 24]. The severity of infection differs depending on the mouse strain studied [25]. C3H/HeN strains are known to shed chlamydiae for a longer period than C57BL/6 strains (7 weeks vs 4 weeks) [23, 25]. This difference may be attributable to innate and acquired immune response differences that are dependent on interferon

(IFN)- $\gamma$  effectors, p47 guanosine triphosphatases (GTPases), and major histocompatibility complex (MHC) class II molecules, although these were identified in nonurogenital infection models [26–28]. The kinetics of infection in male mice is less well defined but appears to last consistently for  $\geq 4$  weeks [29].

The mouse *C. muridarum* urogenital infection model mimics human infection and immune responses in numerous ways and is very instructive in outlining the importance of broad immunological categories that contribute to chlamydial clearance. This takes advantage of an extensive mouse immunology knowledge base that has been developed over the years and the ready availability of research reagents. Chlamydial clearance is a collective function of the innate and adaptive immune responses that occur in the genital tract epithelium, resulting in infiltration of neutrophils, macrophages, dendritic cells, and T and B cells and subsequent cytokine secretion. The changes in the cell population and cytokines in the genital tract of mice are detailed in a study by Morrison and Morrison [30]. Early infiltrates in the genital tract are composed of cells of myeloid lineage, followed by a marked increase in CD4<sup>+</sup> cell count 7–10 days after infection; these form perivascular clusters of CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells that persist in genital tract tissues after resolution of the infection. CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells and CD45R<sup>+</sup> B cells are much less numerous. The involvement of numerous cell types and induction of a variety of cytokines indicate that development of immunity to chlamydial genital tract infection is a highly complex event. These candidate innate and adaptive immune factors have been evaluated further by using (1) adoptive transfer of immune cells into naive animals, (2) in vivo depletion of target cell types, and (3) knockout mice.

Collectively, these studies implicate T helper 1 (Th1) cells as having an indispensable role for resolution of chlamydial infection. Mice deficient in Th1 cells, such as nude mice [31], mice with severe combined immunodeficiency [32], T cell receptor  $\beta$ -chain knockout mice [33], and mice deficient in MHC-II molecules [34], either have prolonged high-level infection or fail to resolve primary infection. This is primarily an effect of CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells, because IFN- $\gamma$ -producing CD4<sup>+</sup> T cell clones can resolve chronic infection in athymic mice [35, 36]. Study findings suggest that, in this process, mucosa-associated integrin receptor ( $\alpha 4/\beta 7$  integrin) helps CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells home to urogenital tissues [37, 38]. CD4<sup>-/-</sup> mice have delayed chlamydial clearance but eventually resolve infection, probably owing to the presence of non-CD4<sup>+</sup> helper cells [34].

CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell-deficient ( $\beta 2M$  knockout) and B cell-depleted [39] or -deficient (uMT knockout) mice resolve primary infection with kinetics indistinguishable from those of wild-type mice [40]. On the other hand, chlamydia-specific CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells are generated during chlamydial infection, and adoptive transfer of these clones provides protection against genital tract infection in nude mice, albeit to a lesser degree than CD4<sup>+</sup> T

cells [41]. It has been shown that antigen-specific CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells migrate to genital tract tissue inoculated with *C. trachomatis* and serve as a potential source of IFN- $\gamma$  [42]. Thus, although CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells are a dispensable mechanism for resolution of primary infection in mice, they may be of greater importance in other systems. Similarly, cells involved primarily in innate immunity, such as neutrophils [43] and natural killer T (NKT) cells [44], may play limited roles in controlling early stages of infection but do not appear essential for the resolution of primary infection. This is supported by the observations that neutrophil depletion is associated with increased chlamydial shedding during the first week of infection and a relative delay in resolution and that depletion of NKT cells results in delayed resolution. It is likely that NKT cells serve as an early source of cytokines, such as IFN- $\gamma$  [44].

A role for IFN- $\gamma$  in clearance of primary infection has been proved by the observation of delayed infection resolution in mice in which IFN- $\gamma$  has been neutralized by monoclonal antibody. In addition, passive transfer of IFN- $\gamma$  to chronically infected athymic mice potently suppresses urogenital shedding of *C. muridarum* in some mice and resolves infection in others [35]. Moreover, it has been shown that, although IFN- $\gamma$  knockout mice can have significantly reduced chlamydial burden in the lower genital tract, they continue to shed *C. muridarum* intermittently at low levels [32]. Although the contribution of IFN- $\gamma$  to *C. muridarum* clearance in this model is clear, the impact is not as powerful as it is on *C. trachomatis*, as discussed below [32, 33, 45]. In murine cells, *C. muridarum* appears capable of evading murine-specific IFN- $\gamma$  effector mechanisms that involve p47 GTPases, which may account for this difference, although this process has not been evaluated in the genital tract [46, 47]. Details on broad issues of research with the *C. muridarum* mouse model are reviewed elsewhere [9, 11–15].

**Mouse models using *C. trachomatis*.** Mice can be infected urogenitally with human *C. trachomatis* serovars [8]. However, a higher inoculum is required with *C. trachomatis* than with *C. muridarum*, the peak bacterial load is 1–2 logs lower, the infection is eradicated relatively quickly [48], and pathology is mostly limited to the lower genital tract. Earlier work revealed that nude mice clear human strains of *C. trachomatis* [49] readily from the genital tract, indicating that murine innate immune responses are sufficient to clear *C. trachomatis*. These circumstances compromise the usefulness of this model for the study of acquired immunity or vaccine efficacy, but the mechanistic understanding of why *C. trachomatis* is cleared efficiently from mice is important in interpreting results of studies that use *C. muridarum*.

Studies suggest that the highly efficient clearance of *C. trachomatis* from the mouse genital tract is mediated by robust murine-specific IFN- $\gamma$ -induced innate effector mechanisms [46, 47]. In contrast to the relatively modest effect of IFN- $\gamma$

on *C. muridarum*, several groups have shown that *C. trachomatis* infection of IFN- $\gamma$  or IFN- $\gamma$  receptor knockout mice results in a more pronounced delay in clearance of this species, compared with similar experiments in the *C. muridarum* model [45, 50]. The IFN- $\gamma$  effector mechanisms in humans are primarily thought to involve indoleamine dioxygenase (IDO) activation that depletes intracellular pools of tryptophan, which starves human serovars of *C. trachomatis* of an essential amino acid. The end effect of this at high IFN- $\gamma$  concentrations can be cidal, whereas at lower concentrations, the result is to drive the organism into a viable but nonreplicating “persistent” form [51, 52]. Of interest, mice do not appear to induce IDO in response to chlamydial infection but instead have redundant mechanisms that involve IFN- $\gamma$ -inducible effectors inducing nitric oxide synthase, p47 GTPases, and perhaps other mechanisms that appear to have bactericidal effects on the organism in cell culture [53]. However, low-level infection appears to continue in mice, because chlamydial nucleic acids (major outer membrane protein DNA and 16S RNA) can be detected for very long periods after culture resolution of infection [54]. Shedding of *C. muridarum* (albeit briefly and in low numbers) can be reactivated for up to 3–4 weeks after culture-proven resolution of infection [22, 54]. Thus, although different end-line IFN- $\gamma$ -mediated mechanisms may be at work in humans and mice, persistent and chronic low-grade infection appears to occur in both species, and in both species, it is plausible that persistence versus clearance is driven by IFN- $\gamma$  responses.

**Guinea pig models.** Guinea pigs can be infected urogenitally with *Chlamydia caviae* (formerly *Chlamydia psittaci* guinea pig inclusion conjunctivitis strain), which causes conjunctivitis in the natural infection [55, 56]. The guinea pig genital tract infection model was one of the first to be established [9]. Inoculation with *C. caviae* in the lower genital tract causes a self-limited infection with a duration of 3–4 weeks that involves the squamous epithelium of the ectocervix and squamocolumnar junction. Ascending genital tract infection of the oviducts occurs in ~80% of infected guinea pigs [57]. This model has several unique advantages over other animal models. Infections can be established in male animals, thus providing the opportunity to model sexual transmission [56]. In addition, vertical transmission from mothers to newborn pups [6] occurs in this model. Guinea pigs also have a long estrous phase (17 vs 4–5 days in mice) comparable to that in humans, making this a more appropriate model to study hormonal influences on pathogenesis. Oral contraceptive agents, consisting of mestranol and norethynodrel, enhance ascending infections in female guinea pigs and prolong duration of infection [58, 59].

The immune responses seen in guinea pigs have also been studied in detail, and findings are in some ways similar to but in other ways different from what has been shown in murine models. Early infection (before or on day 5) is characterized

by an influx of polymorphonuclear cells to the epithelium and mononuclear cells by day 10 [60]. Involvement of T cells in guinea pigs has been evaluated using anti-thymocyte serum [61], which results in a depletion of T cells only in the peripheral circulation. This leads to a prolonged low-level infection throughout the anti-thymocyte treatment course, compatible with findings in T cell–depleted mice. Cell populations associated with resolution of infection involve more CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells than in mice [62], similar to what has been seen in nonhuman primates [63] and humans [64]. In contrast to mice, in which B cell depletion had no role in resolving primary infection, decreased antibody production has been found to correlate with delayed clearance of primary infection in guinea pigs treated with cytotoxic agents or estradiol [65, 66].

A problem with the guinea pig model is the limited available reagents with which to study immune responses in this species. Considering that guinea pigs are used extensively in other infection models, there is hope that more reagents will be made available and this problem can be overcome.

**Nonhuman primate models.** Nonhuman primates, including the marmoset, grivet, and pigtailed macaque, have been used as models for *C. trachomatis* genital tract infection for decades and would intuitively be the closest surrogate models for humans. Infection in grivet monkeys elicited acute salpingitis after inoculation into either the fallopian tube directly or the uterine cavity [67]. Studies on the mode of spread of chlamydial infection continued in the grivet model [68]. Marmosets were studied as a model for ascending chlamydial infection; cervicitis resulted after intravaginal inoculation, but upper tract disease was minimal [69].

Pigtailed macaques were first used in the early 1980s as a model for chlamydial genital disease. The advantages of this primate model include the animal’s size, relatively quiet temperament, and well-characterized menstrual cycle. The normal anatomy and physiology of the macaque reproductive tract are remarkably similar to those in humans. Pigtailed macaques are naturally susceptible to cervical infection with human biovars of *C. trachomatis*, which may be cultured from the cervix for up to 15 weeks [70] after primary inoculation. The kinetics of infection are distinct from those in mouse or guinea pig models. Shedding from the cervical os is intermittent, and the peak of the infection may be delayed for months. Repeated cervical inoculations cause salpingitis and peritubal adhesions, although intratubal challenge increases the severity of upper tract disease [71]. These observations suggest that macaques develop a chronic indolent infection similar to that documented in humans. In parallel with the in situ pigtailed macaque challenge studies, an autotransplant tissue model was developed in the pigtailed macaque. This model allows for multiple samplings of infected salpinx tissue over time and requires minimal surgical intervention [21].

Initial immune responses in nonhuman primates are characterized by early polymorphonuclear cells in the endocervix [69], followed by mononuclear lymphocytic infiltrates similar to those in other animal models [20]. Humoral response, as evidenced by serum and cervical secretory antibody production, also has been documented in macaques [20]. Van Voorhis et al [63] showed that, after a single inoculation, cytokine gene expression profiles consistent with Th1-like responses occur. However, the predominant cell infiltrate after single or repeated *C. trachomatis* inoculation consists of CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells rather than CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells or B cells and suggests a fundamental difference between rodents and primates with regard to the T cell subset responses to chlamydial infection [72]. Data from genetic studies of variations in the outcome of infection in macaque monkeys indicate the association of pathology with genetic polymorphism in the MHC-I molecule and support the aforementioned findings [73].

**Other animal models.** Evidence for chronic chlamydial infection or persistence in alternative large animal models holds promise, but these models are much less well studied than murine, guinea pig, and nonhuman primate models. Pigs are naturally infected by *Chlamydia suis* and *Chlamydia abortus*. Although these species cause natural enteric and lung infections in pigs, experimental models of genital tract infection also have been developed using human *C. trachomatis* serovar E strains [74]. *C. trachomatis* establishes infection in the epithelium of the endocervix and uterus in female pigs (gilts), resulting in an erythematous vulva along with an elevated temperature, suggesting a systemic response to infection. Ascending infection has been documented, with chlamydial shedding detected for up to 21 days. Although the observations with this model are somewhat limited, in enteric models of *C. suis* infection, chlamydiae can be observed in tissues as aberrant forms, suggesting that *C. suis* may establish persistent infection in pigs [75].

The pig model also has potential use in evaluating hormonal responses. In humans, the use of oral contraceptives is also known to be associated with increased rates of infection [76], and the stage of the estrous cycle affects growth of chlamydiae in human cells [77]. Likewise, the rate of infectivity of primary cells obtained from pigs was greatest when cells were obtained during the estrogen-dominant phase [78]. *C. abortus* causes abortion and stillbirth in sheep and can persist in the females for >1 year after they give birth [19, 79]. Although this model is used primarily to understand the pathogenesis of abortion, persistent infection of the reproductive tract has been documented. Very little is known about the immune responses responsible for resolving infection in this model.

## USEFULNESS OF ANIMAL MODELS IN STUDYING HUMAN *C. TRACHOMATIS* GENITAL TRACT INFECTION

The ultimate goal of research is to determine effective public health interventions to control chlamydial genital tract infections; an understanding of basic chlamydia-host biology can shed light on whether to implement a number of public health strategies. Toward this end, one role of animal models is to guide the development of safe and effective vaccines. This, in turn, requires understanding of the factors that influence clearance of infection. Studies in humans and animals have found that immunological parameters, genetic background, and hormonal influences affect clearance of chlamydial infection in either system. However, drawing parallels from animal models to humans remains a challenge, and we must now ask difficult questions concerning what we can and cannot apply to humans and how we can design future animal studies to maximize translational value.

Despite the differences among models, a consistent single major conclusion can be drawn from animal studies that probably has significance for human infection [4]: elicitation of T cell-mediated immunity is important for clearance of the organism. Studies using mouse models have identified MHC-II antigen processing and CD4<sup>+</sup> T cell/Th1 cell responses mediated by IFN- $\gamma$  as central to chlamydial clearance in primary infection. Studies in guinea pigs further implicate the role of T cells and, possibly, antibodies. Although it is difficult to determine what induces clearance in nonhuman primates, immunological correlates of clearance suggest involvement of T cells and Th1 cytokines. Finally, in humans, chlamydial genital tract infection in women results in secretion of local immunoglobulin A and G responses and infiltration by lymphocytes that have proliferative responses against *C. trachomatis*, indicating that both humoral and cell-mediated immune responses are induced by infection and ultimately result in clearance [4]. This concept of eliciting a proper Th1-mediated T cell response is central in the current design of vaccines against chlamydia.

However, there are a number of unresolved issues. A major difference vis-à-vis human infection is the variability in the kinetics of chlamydial growth and the duration of primary infection in these animal models. In mice or guinea pigs, detection of viable chlamydiae from the lower urogenital tract is limited to the first 3–4 weeks of relatively robust infection course, although mice continue to shed chlamydial nucleic acids for months, and small numbers of viable organisms can be recovered if mice are immunosuppressed [54]. Indolent intermittent shedding of viable *C. trachomatis* has been documented for up to 15 weeks in primates [70], and *C. psittaci* shedding has been documented for up to 1 year in sheep [79]. Studies in humans suggest that half of infected women may continue to be infected beyond a year [3]. These differences are an in-

dication that the course of chlamydial infection differs to various degrees depending on the animal host, the chlamydia species used, and the anatomic site of infection for each model. They also pose a challenge both for interpreting what we learn from animal models and for developing new research questions.

At least 2 clear differences in immune responses may account for the observed differences in the duration of infection. In guinea pigs and monkeys, CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells are more abundant than CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells, which are associated with resolution of infection in mice. Some data suggest that CD8<sup>+</sup> T cells play some role at least in the initial phase of infection resolution, whereas in mice, they are dispensable. Both CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> cells are recruited to the endocervix during *C. trachomatis* infection in humans, and the proportion appears to be situational, based on clinical presentation [80]. In this study, higher organism load in cervical swab samples from women with chlamydial infection was associated with an increased number of local CD4<sup>+</sup> cells [80]. Because of the cross-sectional nature of the study, it is unclear whether this represents recruitment of protective cells in response to increasing chlamydial load or a relative ineffectiveness of CD4<sup>+</sup> T cells in human infection. The basis for the differences in T cell subsets and whether they reflect efficiency of clearance are still unknown. A number of studies and reviews have addressed the differences in IFN- $\gamma$  effector mechanisms in mice and humans [46]. Mice induce effectors that include p47 GTPases, which appear to have sterilizing immunity against a variety of intracellular organisms. This defense system seems almost completely absent in humans, in whom the primary response seems to be tryptophan starvation by IDO, which would cause a persistent state of infection [81]. This difference could explain the discrepancies between mice and humans in the kinetics of chlamydial growth and shedding, although it also has not been validated *in vivo*.

Two possible avenues in animal research may address these issues. One approach is to exploit nonmurine models, and the other is to generate “humanized” animal models. Currently, there is little mechanistic understanding of the immune responses in models other than mice and guinea pigs. For example, do nonhuman primates induce IDO in response to IFN- $\gamma$  and induce a state of tryptophan starvation? The use of class I matched animals used in human immunodeficiency virus (HIV) or simian immunodeficiency virus research [82] may also help in exploring the basis of the CD8<sup>+</sup> T cell–predominant responses observed in primates. These models may prove to have better correlates to human responses and may help explain the aforementioned differences.

Decades of research in the field of humanized mice have led to the creation of mice that allow engraftment of human tissue, ranging from hematopoietic cells to skin, enabling infection of mice with agents that have high species-specific tropism, such as HIV and varicella-zoster virus [83, 84]. Although it is still

impractical to study the pathogenesis of *C. trachomatis* directly in mice owing to the barrier in species-specific innate immunity, such advances may allow this. With current capabilities, mouse models will continue to be useful in defining specific molecular mechanisms. In addition, as mentioned above, removal of murine-specific effectors promotes chronic infection [54], suggesting that this is a potential strategy in studying chronic infection. For example, we could generate mice that are deficient in murine IFN- $\gamma$  effectors but instead express IDO, a predominant IFN- $\gamma$  response mechanism in human cells, to address the specific question of *in vivo* persistence and interaction of genital strains of *C. trachomatis* that possess tryptophan synthase [81].

Although research has stressed identification of immune factors related to chlamydial clearance, individual variability in disease severity in human populations may also be attributable to the complex interaction of the host genetic factors and environmental factors. Animal models can be used to model individual factors that influence effective public health strategies. For example, a relatively simple mouse model using antibiotics revealed that early antibiotic therapy in mice hinders the development of effective immunity [85]; a parallel process was hypothesized to explain an increased incidence of repeat infection in a human population after the implementation of screening and early treatment (the “arrested immunity” hypothesis) [86]. Genetic differences in mouse strains and macaques influence resolution of infection and are likely to be attributable to polymorphisms in immune-related genes. Although genetic studies in animal models may not provide direct correlates to humans, they define novel sets of genes and immune mechanisms that may be important in clearance of chlamydia and can be explored in translational human studies. They also help define the similarities and differences between animal models and humans and, thereby, the usefulness of each model described thus far. Genetic polymorphisms may also serve as tractable targets for human research because of the difficulty in assessing immune responses during a natural infection. In this context, animal models may guide the design of clinical studies.

Such creative use of animal models will build on this valuable body of knowledge but will need to be carefully designed to address differences between animals and humans. At the same time, we will need to take the difficult steps necessary to promote more translational research and apply what we have already learned from animal research to humans.

## Acknowledgments

We thank Drs David Martin and Sami Gottlieb for helpful discussions and review of this manuscript.

## References

- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. *Chlamydia* Prevalence Monitoring Project annual report 2007: sexually transmitted disease surveillance 2007 supplement. Atlanta, GA: Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 2009.
- Global prevalence and incidence of selected curable sexually transmitted infections. Geneva, Switzerland: World Health Organization, 2001.
- Molano M, Meijer CJ, Weiderpass E, et al. The natural course of *Chlamydia trachomatis* infection in asymptomatic Colombian women: a 5-year follow-up study. *J Infect Dis* 2005; 191:907–916.
- Geisler W. Duration of untreated uncomplicated *Chlamydia trachomatis* genital infection and factors associated with chlamydia resolution: a review of human studies. *J Infect Dis* 2010; 201(suppl 2):S104–S113 (in this supplement).
- Mount DT, Bigazzi PE, Barron AL. Experimental genital infection of male guinea pigs with the agent of guinea pig inclusion conjunctivitis and transmission to females. *Infect Immun* 1973; 8:925–930.
- Mount DT, Bigazzi PE, Barron AL. Infection of genital tract and transmission of ocular infection to newborns by the agent of guinea pig inclusion conjunctivitis. *Infect Immun* 1972; 5:921–926.
- Barron AL, White HJ, Rank RG, Soloff BL, Moses EB. A new animal model for the study of *Chlamydia trachomatis* genital infections: infection of mice with the agent of mouse pneumonitis. *J Infect Dis* 1981; 143: 63–66.
- Tuffrey M, Taylor-Robinson D. Progesterone as a key factor in the development of a mouse model for genital tract infection with *Chlamydia trachomatis*. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* 1981; 12:111–115.
- Patton DL, Rank RG. Animal models for the study of pelvic inflammatory diseases. In: Quinn TC, ed. Sexually transmitted diseases. New York: Raven Press, 1992:85–111.
- Rank RG, Whittum-Hudson J. Protective immunity to *Chlamydia*: evidence from animal studies. *J Infect Dis* 2010; 201(suppl 2):S168–S177 (in this supplement).
- Morrison RP, Caldwell HD. Immunity to murine chlamydial genital infection. *Infect Immun* 2002; 70:2741–2751.
- Brunham RC, Rey-Ladino J. Immunology of *Chlamydia* infection: implications for a *Chlamydia trachomatis* vaccine. *Nat Rev Immunol* 2005; 5: 149–161.
- Bavoil PM, Wyrick PB, eds. *Chlamydia* genomics and pathogenesis. Wymondham, United Kingdom: Horizon Bioscience, 2006.
- Roan NR, Starnbach MN. Immune-mediated control of *Chlamydia* infection. *Cell Microbiol* 2008; 10:9–19.
- Rank RG. Chlamydial diseases. In: Fox Jea, ed. The mouse in biomedical research. 2nd ed. Vol 2. San Diego, CA: Elsevier, 2007:325–348.
- Janowicz DM, Ofner S, Katz BP, Spinola SM. Experimental infection of human volunteers with *Haemophilus ducreyi*: fifteen years of clinical data and experience. *J Infect Dis* 2009; 199:1671–1679.
- Cohen MS, Cannon JG. Human experimentation with *Neisseria gonorrhoeae*: progress and goals. *J Infect Dis* 1999; 179(suppl 2):S375–S379.
- Vanrompay D, Lyons JM, Morre SA. Animal models for the study of *Chlamydia trachomatis* infections in the female genital infection. *Drugs Today (Barc)* 2006; 42(suppl A):55–63.
- Papp JR, Shewen PE. *Chlamydia psittaci* infection in sheep: a paradigm for human reproductive tract infection. *J Reprod Immunol* 1997; 34: 185–202.
- Patton DL, Halbert SA, Kuo CC, Wang SP, Holmes KK. Host response to primary *Chlamydia trachomatis* infection of the fallopian tube in pig-tailed monkeys. *Fertil Steril* 1983; 40:829–840.
- Patton DL, Kuo CC, Wang SP, et al. Chlamydial infection of subcutaneous fimbrial transplants in cynomolgus and rhesus monkeys. *J Infect Dis* 1987; 155:229–235.
- Cotter TW, Miranpuri GS, Ramsey KH, Poulsen CE, Byrne GI. Reactivation of chlamydial genital tract infection in mice. *Infect Immun* 1997; 65:2067–2073.
- de la Maza LM, Pal S, Khamesipour A, Peterson EM. Intravaginal inoculation of mice with the *Chlamydia trachomatis* mouse pneumonitis biovar results in infertility. *Infect Immun* 1994; 62:2094–2097.
- Shah AA, Schripsema JH, Imtiaz MT, et al. Histopathologic changes related to fibrotic oviduct occlusion after genital tract infection of mice with *Chlamydia muridarum*. *Sex Transm Dis* 2005; 32:49–56.
- Darville T, Andrews CW Jr, Laffoon KK, Shymasani W, Kishen LR, Rank RG. Mouse strain-dependent variation in the course and outcome of chlamydial genital tract infection is associated with differences in host response. *Infect Immun* 1997; 65:3065–3073.
- Bernstein-Hanley I, Coers J, Balsara ZR, Taylor GA, Starnbach MN, Dietrich WF. The p47 GTPases Igtg and Irgb10 map to the *Chlamydia trachomatis* susceptibility locus Ctrq-3 and mediate cellular resistance in mice. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 2006; 103:14092–14097.
- Min-Oo G, Lindqvist L, Vaglenov A, et al. Genetic control of susceptibility to pulmonary infection with *Chlamydia pneumoniae* in the mouse. *Genes Immun* 2008; 9:383–388.
- Miyairi I, Tatireddigari VR, Mahdi OS, et al. The p47 GTPases Iigp2 and Irgb10 regulate innate immunity and inflammation to murine *Chlamydia psittaci* infection. *J Immunol* 2007; 179:1814–1824.
- Pal S, Peterson EM, de la Maza LM. New murine model for the study of *Chlamydia trachomatis* genitourinary tract infections in males. *Infect Immun* 2004; 72:4210–4216.
- Morrison SG, Morrison RP. In situ analysis of the evolution of the primary immune response in murine *Chlamydia trachomatis* genital tract infection. *Infect Immun* 2000; 68:2870–2879.
- Rank RG, Soderberg LS, Barron AL. Chronic chlamydial genital infection in congenitally athymic nude mice. *Infect Immun* 1985; 48:847–849.
- Cotter TW, Ramsey KH, Miranpuri GS, Poulsen CE, Byrne GI. Dissemination of *Chlamydia trachomatis* chronic genital tract infection in gamma interferon gene knockout mice. *Infect Immun* 1997; 65:2145–2152.
- Perry LL, Feilzer K, Caldwell HD. Immunity to *Chlamydia trachomatis* is mediated by T helper 1 cells through IFN-gamma-dependent and -independent pathways. *J Immunol* 1997; 158:3344–3352.
- Morrison RP, Feilzer K, Tumas DB. Gene knockout mice establish a primary protective role for major histocompatibility complex class II-restricted responses in *Chlamydia trachomatis* genital tract infection. *Infect Immun* 1995; 63:4661–4668.
- Rank RG, Ramsey KH, Pack EA, Williams DM. Effect of gamma interferon on resolution of murine chlamydial genital infection. *Infect Immun* 1992; 60:4427–4429.
- Igietseme JU, Ramsey KH, Magee DM, Williams DM, Kincy TJ, Rank RG. Resolution of murine chlamydial genital infection by the adoptive transfer of a biovar-specific, Th1 lymphocyte clone. *Reg Immunol* 1993; 5: 317–324.
- Kelly KA, Rank RG. Identification of homing receptors that mediate the recruitment of CD4 T cells to the genital tract following intravaginal infection with *Chlamydia trachomatis*. *Infect Immun* 1997; 65:5198–5208.
- Hawkins RA, Rank RG, Kelly KA. Expression of mucosal homing receptor alpha4beta7 is associated with enhanced migration to the *Chlamydia*-infected murine genital mucosa in vivo. *Infect Immun* 2000; 68: 5587–5594.
- Ramsey KH, Soderberg LS, Rank RG. Resolution of chlamydial genital infection in B-cell-deficient mice and immunity to reinfection. *Infect Immun* 1988; 56:1320–1325.
- Johansson M, Ward M, Lycke N. B-cell-deficient mice develop complete immune protection against genital tract infection with *Chlamydia trachomatis*. *Immunology* 1997; 92:422–428.
- Igietseme JU, Magee DM, Williams DM, Rank RG. Role for CD8+ T cells in antichlamydial immunity defined by *Chlamydia*-specific T-lymphocyte clones. *Infect Immun* 1994; 62:5195–5197.
- Roan NR, Starnbach MN. Antigen-specific CD8+ T cells respond to *Chlamydia trachomatis* in the genital mucosa. *J Immunol* 2006; 177: 7974–7979.
- Barteneva N, Theodor I, Peterson EM, de la Maza LM. Role of neutrophils in controlling early stages of a *Chlamydia trachomatis* infection. *Infect Immun* 1996; 64:4830–4833.

44. Tseng CT, Rank RG. Role of NK cells in early host response to chlamydial genital infection. *Infect Immun* **1998**;66:5867–5875.
45. Ito JI, Lyons JM. Role of gamma interferon in controlling murine chlamydial genital tract infection. *Infect Immun* **1999**;67:5518–5521.
46. Nelson DE, Virok DP, Wood H, et al. Chlamydial IFN-gamma immune evasion is linked to host infection tropism. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* **2005**;102:10658–10663.
47. Coers J, Bernstein-Hanley I, Grotsky D, et al. *Chlamydia muridarum* evades growth restriction by the IFN-gamma-inducible host resistance factor Irgb10. *J Immunol* **2008**;180:6237–6245.
48. Perry LL, Su H, Feilzer K, et al. Differential sensitivity of distinct *Chlamydia trachomatis* isolates to IFN-gamma-mediated inhibition. *J Immunol* **1999**;162:3541–3548.
49. Tuffrey M, Falder P, Taylor-Robinson D. Genital-tract infection and disease in nude and immunologically competent mice after inoculation of a human strain of *Chlamydia trachomatis*. *Br J Exp Pathol* **1982**;63:539–539–546.
50. Johansson M, Schon K, Ward M, Lycke N. Genital tract infection with *Chlamydia trachomatis* fails to induce protective immunity in gamma interferon receptor-deficient mice despite a strong local immunoglobulin A response. *Infect Immun* **1997**;65:1032–1044.
51. Beatty WL, Morrison RP, Byrne GI. Persistent chlamydiae: from cell culture to a paradigm for chlamydial pathogenesis. *Microbiol Rev* **1994**;58:686–699.
52. Wyrick PB. *Chlamydia trachomatis* persistence in vitro: an overview. *J Infect Dis* **2010**;201(suppl 2):S88–S95 (in this supplement).
53. Ramsey KH, Miranpuri GS, Poulsen CE, Marthakis NB, Braune LM, Byrne GI. Inducible nitric oxide synthase does not affect resolution of murine chlamydial genital tract infections or eradication of chlamydiae in primary murine cell culture. *Infect Immun* **1998**;66:835–838.
54. Ramsey KH, Miranpuri GS, Sigar IM, Ouellette S, Byrne GI. *Chlamydia trachomatis* persistence in the female mouse genital tract: inducible nitric oxide synthase and infection outcome. *Infect Immun* **2001**;69:5131–5137.
55. Murray ES. Guinea pig inclusion conjunctivitis virus. I. Isolation and identification as a member of the psittacosis-lymphogranuloma-trachoma group. *J Infect Dis* **1964**;114:1–12.
56. Rank RG, Bowlin AK, Reed RL, Darville T. Characterization of chlamydial genital infection resulting from sexual transmission from male to female guinea pigs and determination of infectious dose. *Infect Immun* **2003**;71:6148–6154.
57. Rank RG, Sanders MM. Pathogenesis of endometritis and salpingitis in a guinea pig model of chlamydial genital infection. *Am J Pathol* **1992**;140:927–936.
58. Rank RG, White HJ, Hough AJ Jr, Pasley JN, Barron AL. Effect of estradiol on chlamydial genital infection of female guinea pigs. *Infect Immun* **1982**;38:699–705.
59. Rank RG, Sanders MM, Kidd AT. Influence of the estrous cycle on the development of upper genital tract pathology as a result of chlamydial infection in the guinea pig model of pelvic inflammatory disease. *Am J Pathol* **1993**;142:1291–1296.
60. Barron AL, White HJ, Rank RG, Soloff BL. Target tissues associated with genital infection of female guinea pigs by the chlamydial agent of guinea pig inclusion conjunctivitis. *J Infect Dis* **1979**;139:60–68.
61. Rank RG, Barron AL. Effect of antithymocyte serum on the course of chlamydial genital infection in female guinea pigs. *Infect Immun* **1983**;41:876–879.
62. Rank RG, Bowlin AK, Kelly KA. Characterization of lymphocyte response in the female genital tract during ascending chlamydial genital infection in the guinea pig model. *Infect Immun* **2000**;68:5293–5298.
63. Van Voorhis WC, Barrett LK, Sweeney YT, Kuo CC, Patton DL. Analysis of lymphocyte phenotype and cytokine activity in the inflammatory infiltrates of the upper genital tract of female macaques infected with *Chlamydia trachomatis*. *J Infect Dis* **1996**;174:647–650.
64. Ficarra M, Ibana JS, Poretta C, et al. A distinct cellular profile is seen in the human endocervix during *Chlamydia trachomatis* infection. *Am J Reprod Immunol* **2008**;60:415–425.
65. Rank RG, White HJ, Barron AL. Humoral immunity in the resolution of genital infection in female guinea pigs infected with the agent of guinea pig inclusion conjunctivitis. *Infect Immun* **1979**;26:573–579.
66. Rank RG, Barron AL. Specific effect of estradiol on the genital mucosal antibody response in chlamydial ocular and genital infections. *Infect Immun* **1987**;55:2317–2319.
67. Ripa KT, Moller BR, Mardh PA, Freundt EA, Melsen F. Experimental acute salpingitis in grivet monkeys provoked by *Chlamydia trachomatis*. *Acta Pathol Microbiol Scand B* **1979**;87B:65–70.
68. Moller BR, Mardh PA. Experimental epididymitis and urethritis in grivet monkeys provoked by *Chlamydia trachomatis*. *Fertil Steril* **1980**;34:275–279.
69. Johnson AP, Hare MJ, Wilbanks GD, et al. A colposcopic and histological study of experimental chlamydial cervicitis in marmosets. *Br J Exp Pathol* **1984**;65:59–65.
70. Wolner-Hanssen P, Patton DL, Holmes KK. Protective immunity in pig-tailed macaques after cervical infection with *Chlamydia trachomatis*. *Sex Transm Dis* **1991**;18:21–25.
71. Patton DL. Immunopathology and histopathology of experimental chlamydial salpingitis. *Rev Infect Dis* **1985**;7:746–753.
72. Van Voorhis WC, Barrett LK, Sweeney YT, Kuo CC, Patton DL. Repeated *Chlamydia trachomatis* infection of *Macaca nemestrina* fallopian tubes produces a Th1-like cytokine response associated with fibrosis and scarring. *Infect Immun* **1997**;65:2175–2182.
73. Lichtenwalner AB, Patton DL, Cosgrove Sweeney YT, Gaur LK, Stamm WE. Evidence of genetic susceptibility to *Chlamydia trachomatis*-induced pelvic inflammatory disease in the pig-tailed macaque. *Infect Immun* **1997**;65:2250–2253.
74. Vanrompay D, Hoang TQ, De Vos L, et al. Specific-pathogen-free pigs as an animal model for studying *Chlamydia trachomatis* genital infection. *Infect Immun* **2005**;73:8317–8321.
75. Pospischil A, Borel N, Chowdhury EH, Guscetti F. Aberrant chlamydial developmental forms in the gastrointestinal tract of pigs spontaneously and experimentally infected with *Chlamydia suis*. *Vet Microbiol* **2008**;35:147–156.
76. Louv WC, Austin H, Perlman J, Alexander WJ. Oral contraceptive use and the risk of chlamydial and gonococcal infections. *Am J Obstet Gynecol* **1989**;160:396–402.
77. Maslow AS, Davis CH, Choong J, Wyrick PB. Estrogen enhances attachment of *Chlamydia trachomatis* to human endometrial epithelial cells in vitro. *Am J Obstet Gynecol* **1988**;159:1006–1014.
78. Guseva NV, Knight ST, Whittimore JD, Wyrick PB. Primary cultures of female swine genital epithelial cells in vitro: a new approach for the study of hormonal modulation of *Chlamydia* infection. *Infect Immun* **2003**;71:4700–4710.
79. Papp JR, Shewen PE. Localization of chronic *Chlamydia psittaci* infection in the reproductive tract of sheep. *J Infect Dis* **1996**;174:1296–1302.
80. Agrawal T, Vats V, Salhan S, Mittal A. Determination of chlamydial load and immune parameters in asymptomatic, symptomatic and infertile women. *FEMS Immunol Med Microbiol* **2009**;55:250–257.
81. Coers J, Starnbach MN, Howard JC. Modeling infectious disease in mice: co-adaptation and the role of host-specific IFN-gamma responses. *PLoS Pathog* **2009**;5:e1000333.
82. Goulder PJ, Watkins DI. Impact of MHC class I diversity on immune control of immunodeficiency virus replication. *Nat Rev Immunol* **2008**;8:619–630.
83. Shultz LD, Ishikawa F, Greiner DL. Humanized mice in translational biomedical research. *Nat Rev Immunol* **2007**;7:118–130.
84. Ku CC, Zerboni L, Ito H, Graham BS, Wallace M, Arvin AM. Varicella-zoster virus transfer to skin by T cells and modulation of viral replication by epidermal cell interferon-alpha. *J Exp Med* **2004**;200:917–925.
85. Su H, Morrison R, Messer R, Whitmire W, Hughes S, Caldwell HD. The effect of doxycycline treatment on the development of protective immunity in a murine model of chlamydial genital infection. *J Infect Dis* **1999**;180:1252–1258.
86. Brunham RC, Rekart ML. The arrested immunity hypothesis and the epidemiology of chlamydia control. *Sex Transm Dis* **2008**;35:53–54.